



## OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE

---

MINUTES of a MEETING held at COUNTY HALL, TROWBRIDGE on 9 NOVEMBER 2006.

PRESENT: Mr JB Osborn (Chairman), Mr BE Dalton, Mr A Davis, Mr AN Deane, Dr JM English, Mrs ME Groom, Mr A Molland, Mrs P Rugg, Mr A Trotman and Mr RS While.

Also present: David Gibby and Ian Allen, Ringway  
Craig Manton, Mouchel Parkman  
Mr W Moss, County Councillor

---

49. **Apologies** Mr P Batchelor, Mr RT Rogers and Mrs JH Rooke

50. **Minutes of Previous Meeting**

Resolved: To confirm and sign the minutes of the meeting held on 8th September 2006.

51. **Chairman's Announcements**

(1) The Chairman informed the Committee that other leading scrutiny members and himself recently hosted representatives from Surrey CC and Gloucestershire CC at their request to discuss reviews that each were undertaking into their scrutiny arrangements.

(2) The Chairman mentioned that the issue of revised proposals for allowances for scrutiny members considered at the last meeting but deferred pending work by Brig Hall, would be taken at the next meeting due to Brig Hall's absence.

(3) The Chairman made a number of adjustments to the order of the agenda to accommodate public and partner participation, and confirmed the potential for adjournment for lunch due to the length of the agenda.

52. **Members' Interests** Declared by Mr B Dalton in respect a close relative being a user of day care and transport services (min. no. 59 refers).

53. **Public Participation** The Chairman indicated that this would be taken under the agenda item it related to (min. no. 58 refers).

54. **Ringway Parkman – Annual Review of Service 2005/06** A report by the Director of Environmental Services, along with the Annual Service Review by the contractor, was circulated. David Gibby and Ian Allen were present from Ringway and Craig Manton from Mouchel Parkman.

Peter Binley, for the Director, introduced the report by explaining that this review covered the seventh and final year of the contract. He confirmed that throughout the

past year the contracted services had performed well despite the uncertainty caused by the re-tendering exercise. This was confirmed by independent monitoring and customer satisfaction surveys. Particular problem areas were some programme slippage with integrated transport and structure schemes and quality of workmanship with road lining.

Members then went through the annual report asking a number of questions on matters including the quality of resurfacing and repairs at kerb edge, monitoring of reptile translocation, environmental considerations at design stage, latest position on the Petersfinger park and ride site, the correlation between newly resurfaced roads and increased traffic speeds, charges/costs for motorcyclist training, enforcement of bus clearways, timing of traffic surveys, floodlight costs of Chippenham Viaduct, drainage records, future of Wiltshire Highways Partnership, development of the parish lengthsmen scheme and application in urban areas, proposals for the recycling centre, and contractor skills shortages and staff training. Peter Binley and the Contractor's representatives replied to the questions at the meeting or in some cases would do so in writing after the meeting.

Resolved:

- (1) *To thank Ringway Parkman for their contribution to the County's highways service since 1999.*
- (2) *To make the Cabinet Member for Environment, Transport and Economic Development aware of the issues discussed in receiving the annual review of service report 2005/06.*
- (3) *To note the intension to prepare a joint report from the County Council, Mouchel Parkman and Ringway next year to review performance of the first year of the new highway contracts 2006/07, and in doing so ask that more emphasis is given to making year on year comparisons where possible in order to identify trends.*

55. **Tarmac Limited National Contracting – Annual Review of Service 2005/06** A report by the Director of Environmental Services was circulated, in accordance with the Corporate Procurement Strategy as the annual value of the contract exceeded £1m.

Peter Binley, for the Director, introduced the report by explaining the background to this one-off 12 month contract as a consequence of a substantial increase in highway maintenance expenditure under the Local Transport Plan. The total value of the work carried out under the contract amounted to £2.25m and was delivered to a high standard with good partner co-ordination.

Resolved:

- (1) *To thank Tarmac Ltd for its successful delivery of the contract and the contribution to the County's highway service during 2005-06.*
- (2) *To note that the surfacing works were now part of the new highway works contract and would therefore be reported as part of a combined review in future.*

56. **New Roads and Street Works Act 1991 – Coring Programme 2006** A report by the Director of Environmental Services was circulated which explained the process of monitoring the work of the statutory undertakers to ensure the integrity of the highway network was maintained.

Peter Binley, for the Director, reported that this year's coring programme resulted in a failure rate of 15% which showed an improvement over the previous years, and none of these failures were attributed to the work of the Council's contractor Ringway Parkman. He also highlighted the potential change in relationship between highways authorities and public utilities as a consequence of emerging regulations under the Traffic Management Act 2004.

Members asked a number of questions including on enforcement and compensation, and sharing information and results with the utilities.

**Resolved:**

- (1) To note the work being undertaken by the County Council with the statutory undertakers to protect the structural integrity of the highway network.*
- (2) To support the proposal for a rolling programme of coring of reinstatements undertaken in conjunction with the public utilities which would be monitored by the Council's officers*
- (3) To be aware of the potential offered by future Traffic Management Act legislation to enable the Council to improve the management of Streetworks on the highway network.*
- (4) To continue with an annual report to the Committee on the performance of public utilities, including the results of any coring programmes.*

57. **Energy Contract – Annual Review** A report by the Director or Environmental services was circulated in accordance with the Corporate Procurement Strategy as the annual value of the contract exceeded £1m.

Mike Swabey, for the Director, introduced the report and spoke about current market conditions, the monitoring that takes place, active collaboration with others and developments since last year. Benchmarking and negotiations resulted in a continuation of the contract with the Office of Government Commerce (OGC) for another year.

Members discussed a number of issues including the use of green energy and energy efficiency measures, and requested to see a copy of the Carbon Management Strategy and Implementation Plan (appended to these minutes).

**Resolved:**

- (1) To acknowledge the continued value for money performance of the Service Level Agreement with the OGC and note the rebates achieved in the contracts.*
- (2) To continue to support the development of corporate strategies to encourage better and more efficient use of energy in County Council services and buildings through the work with the Carbon Trust, the Wiltshire Energy Efficiency Centre and the Wiltshire and Swindon Renewable Energy Forum and by continually assessing the impact of Council services on climate change.*
- (3) To receive in future years separate reports of the energy contract and energy efficiency activities and performance.*

58. **Hay Lane/Croft Road Task Group Final Report** The revised final published report was circulated for consideration and endorsement by the Management Committee. It had been revised as a consequence of further meetings of the Task Group at the

request of the Management Committee following representations about the original wording of paragraph 32 of the report at the last meeting.

The following people asked questions under public participation primarily in respect of the solicitor's letter referred to at the previous meeting, perceived factual inaccuracies in the report and Planning Condition 99:

Mr TH Pepperall, Chairman Lydiard Millicent Parish Council  
Mr A Ivory  
Mrs C Spickernell  
Lady Inchcape  
Mr J Hollis (read by Mrs Spickernell)  
Mr G Yates, Chairman Lydiard Tregoze Parish Council  
Mr P Tinker  
Mr R Scott (read by Lady Inchcape)  
Mrs A Henshaw, Chairman North Wilts and Swindon CPRE (read by Lady Inchcape)  
C J Simpson Gee (read by Mrs C Spickernell)

Jeff Osborn, Chairman of the Management Committee and Tony Deane, Chairman of the Task Group (for its recent meetings) replied orally to the questions under the three primary themes.

Tony Deane then introduced the revised report explaining the variations to the previous report and confirming that it was now supported by all the Task Group members. He reminded the Committee of the terms of reference and time-limited nature of the review recognising that some of the issues had now moved on, including the holding of the public meeting on Condition 99 in Wootton Bassett on 31 October. He also referred to the previous minutes which explained that the solicitor's letter to the Chief Executive would not be handled through the arena of scrutiny for the reasons stated. He highlighted that the Task Group felt there had been failings in the Council's process in being consulted on the planning application as a strategic authority, and then formally moved the conclusions and recommendations in the revised report.

Mollie Groom, who initiated the review, expressed concern that the scrutiny review would be concluded prior to the consideration of the issues raised in the solicitor's letter. She also felt that following the public meeting Condition 99 could not be met and that the County Council should be more in tune with the views of local people. The Chairman encouraged Mollie Groom and her fellow campaigners to make further representations to Cabinet on 22 November in respect of Condition 99. John English expressed sympathy for the campaigners and would personally raise this at Cabinet.

***Resolved:** To endorse the conclusions and recommendations in the revised final report of the Task Group for submission to the Cabinet Member for Planning and Waste for consideration and report back.*

59. **The Future of Day Support Services and Transport for all Client Groups Except Learning Disability – Business Case etc.** A report by the Interim Director of Adult and Community Services was circulated. This was in response to the request made at the last meeting for further information including the business case for the proposal.

The Management Committee's interest in this matter stemmed from its review of the contract extension with OSJ for residential care for older people last November – and the fact that day care provision would be the subject of separate negotiations. As reported at the last meeting, a detailed costing proposal would be submitted to

Cabinet in February 2007 once benchmarking and market testing had been carried out.

Steve Tennison, for the Director, introduced the report and explained the variation in current services and the drive towards promoting independence. Members asked questions on respite provision, funding for transport, multi-agency assessments and complementary therapy such as interaction with pets.

The Chairman felt that the development of day services would now be best picked up as part of the work of the new task group established in response to a recommendation in the Corporate Recovery Task Group final report (see minute 62 below)

*Resolved:* *To thank the Director for his report in response to the request of the Management Committee at the last meeting and agree that the development of day services should be included within the remit of the new task group – see minute 63 below.*

60. **Supported People Procurement Programme – Progress Report** A report by the Interim Director of Adult and Community Services was circulated indicating that individual reviews had been completed on 358 services and that a programme of whole system strategic reviews was continuing.

Members heard about the impact of the new funding formula and asked a number of questions including about the level of performance of the housing providers and clients who received decommissioned services.

*Resolved:*

- (1) To note progress to date and the efficiencies being generated as a consequence of the reviews.*
- (2) To ask that the further involvement of scrutiny be through officer meetings with Grace Hill and John English as the Committee's existing adult care procurement representatives.*

61. **People Strategy Action Plan (HR Business Plan 2006/07)** An edited version of The Human Resources Business Plan 2006/07 was circulated in response to a request from the Management Committee to be kept informed of progress with implementation against the action plan.

Phil Welsh and Yvonne Johnson, representing HR, spoke to the business plan under three themes covering budget, ICT and management/leadership issues focusing on areas of greatest risk to its successful implementation as requested by the Chairman. In particular the further development of the sickness reporting system and talent management initiative, along with potential implications on the leadership programme as a result of budget constraints were highlighted. Capturing data on the staff appraisal scheme and enhancing the administration for learning and development were other areas mentioned as was the potential challenges faced under the Ways of Working project.

Members discussed the introduction of e-recruitment along with the broader benefits of electronic workflow. They also highlighted the importance of the support of managers in order to achieve consistent application of the strategy in all departments. The officers also confirmed the close involvement of the Cabinet Member for Staffing and Procurement in monitoring the implementation of the Strategy's actions.

Resolved:

- (1) To note the progress made in implementing the People Strategy and the areas most at risk as reported under the HR Business Plan 2006/07*
- (2) To note the regular reporting of progress to the Cabinet Member and to seek an annual report to this Committee more clearly defining progress against each of the Strategy's objectives and any associated risks.*
- (3) To ask that the Customer First Scrutiny Task Group pick up the involvement of HR in the Business Management Systems and Ways of Working projects.*

62. **Advertising Services Contract** It was reported that this framework contract was authorised by the Cabinet Member for Staffing and Customer Care on 4 October.

Mike Swabey for the Director, confirmed that this master vendor contract, which also included the four district councils, had been awarded to TMP Worldwide and was anticipated to deliver a 12.6% saving on current costs. Tony Deane had been the scrutiny representative serving on the procurement project board for the letting of this contract.

Resolved: *To note the successful outcome of this procurement exercise.*

63. **Corporate Recovery Task Group Final Report** A copy of the report was circulated to Cabinet for its meeting on 17 October and was re-circulated to members of the Management Committee only. Cabinet noted the recommendations and would be responding as necessary in due course. The Task Group membership was Bill Moss (Chairman), Robert Hall, Patrick Coleman, Jeff Osborn, Judy Rooke and Margaret White.

The Management Committee was asked to endorse the findings and recommendations retrospectively as set out in paragraphs 32-39, and in particular to respond to the recommendation in the final paragraph seeking further reports on specific matters.

Resolved:

- (1) To thank the Corporate Recovery Task Group for their efforts to hold the Executive to account for its recovery plan.*
- (2) To endorse retrospectively the findings and recommendations in the Task Group's final report, and to note Cabinet's response on October 17 to respond formally to the recommendations where appropriate in due course.*
- (3) To establish a scrutiny task group, in response to the first 3 recommendations contained within paragraph 39 of the report, to review DACS proposals for :
  - (i) Transitional arrangements for all client groups*
  - (ii) Development of the local voluntary and community sectors in Wiltshire*
  - (iii) Future involvement of users and carers.**
- (4) To appoint 5 members to serve on the Task Group, including 1 member co-opted from the Health Overview and Scrutiny Committee to reflect the close relationship between health and social care. In the first instance, the Task Group to report to the Management Committee 12 weeks following its first meeting, and to consult with the Cabinet Member(s) for Adult Care Services*

*and the Director of Adult and Community Services over the scope of the review.*

- (5) *In response to its recommendation to the Management Committee in paragraph 39 (iv) of the report, to request the Head of Human Resources to report to the next meeting of the Management Committee on 18 January 2006 on the need for a corporate policy towards the management of staff vacancies. (It is understood that this has already been the subject of debate amongst Chief Officers at CMB).*

**64. Scrutiny and the Local Strategic Partnership (including Streetscene)**

It was reported that this item was deferred by the Management Committee from its meeting in June. The report by the Head of Legal and Democratic Services at the time was re-circulated.

It was reported at the June meeting that if the recommendations in the report were supported then this would mean establishing a task group to specifically review the street management element of the LSP's Streetscene objective. Members discussed that the start of this work would be best delayed until the autumn in order not to divert capacity away from the corporate recovery plan proposal agreed earlier at that meeting. However the principle that it would be appropriate and beneficial to broaden the remit of overview and scrutiny to cover the work of the LSP was agreed.

The Chairman asked that this matter be brought before the Committee again in order to pursue this work now that the Corporate Recovery Task Group had reported. He was also mindful that the recently published "Stronger and Prosperous Communities" Government White Paper calls for overview and scrutiny, amongst other things, to focus on more strategic issues. Members spoke in support of taking this work forward due to the perceived democratic deficit that existed around some of the partnership working.

**Resolved:**

- (1) *To establish a scrutiny task group of 5 members to review the street management element of the LSP's streetscene objective as agreed in principle at the June meeting of the Management Committee.*
- (2) *To consult the existing Streetscene project board in scoping the review including opportunities for joint scrutiny with relevant partners and to receive feedback in 3 months of its first meeting.*

**65. Work Programme** A copy of the latest version of the Management Committee's work programme was circulated along with a brief tabled report regarding expanding the terms of reference of the Customer First Task Group.

**Resolved:**

- (1) *To note the current work programme and alterations made as a consequence of decisions taken earlier in the meeting.*
- (2) *To agree the following revised terms of reference for the Customer First Task Group:*

*"To review the Executive's development and implementation of:*

1. Transformational Government Strategies - including BPR delivery, Single Non-Emergency Number and, Customer First Initiative
2. Change Programme – including Projects such as Ways of Working and Business Management System.”

(3) To note the following scrutiny activities taking place under the direction of the Management Committee:

<b><u>Activity</u></b>	<b><u>Topic</u></b>	<b><u>Members</u></b>	<b><u>Start date</u></b>	<b><u>Next Meeting</u></b>	<b><u>End Date</u></b>
Task Groups	Performance	Mr Newbury (Ch) Mr Osborn Mrs Soden Mrs Taylor Mr While	Nov 02	12 December	Standing
	Budget	Mr Molland (Ch) Brig Hall Mr Coleman Mr Rogers Mr Moss Mr Osborn	Sept 01	14 November	Standing
	E Government/ Customer First	Mr Deane (Ch) Ms Content Mr Dalton Mr A Davis Mr Newbury Mrs Rugg	June 05	7 December	Standing
	Social Care Transition	To be confirmed	Nov 06	To be arranged	
	Street management	To be confirmed	Nov 06	To be arranged	
Procurement Project Boards	Property Services	Mr Henning	Sept 05	-	Nov 06
	Adult Care (inc. Supported People Prog.)	Mrs Hill/Dr English	Jan 06	-	Ongoing

(Duration of Meeting: 10.30 am – 12.45 pm and 2.00 – 3.35 pm)

The Officer who has produced these minutes is Paul Kelly, Democratic & Members' Services, direct line: (01225) 713049.