



## OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE

---

MINUTES of a MEETING held at COUNTY HALL, TROWBRIDGE on 6 September 2007.

**PRESENT:** Mr JB Osborn (Chairman), Mr B Dalton, Mr AN Deane, Dr J English, Mrs ME Groom, Mr A Molland, Mrs JH Rooke, Mrs P Rugg, Mr A Trotman, Mr RT Rogers, Mr I West, Mr K Wren

**Also present:** Mr T Sturgis, Cabinet Member for Planning and Waste  
Mr M Hewson, County Councillor  
Mr W Moss, County Councillor  
Mr G Manton, Mouchel Parkman  
Mr I Allen, Ringway  
Mr S Thorns and Mr A Bowley, Sodexo

---

39. **Apologies** Mr Batchelor, Brig RW Hall and Mr RS While

40. **Minutes of Previous Meeting**

**Resolved:** To confirm and sign the minutes of the meeting held on 7 June 2007

41. **Chairman's Announcements**

(1) An invitation was received from Salisbury DC to join in a scrutiny review of climate change and carbon emissions as a potential unitary pilot scrutiny exercise. The invitation was declined by the Chairman and Vice-Chairman on the basis that the topic was very wide ranging and might be more effectively tackled as individual contributory components. It would also be difficult to commit any resources to the review bearing in mind the current work programme.

(2) The Chairman had written to the Chairman of the Standards Committee following approval of its action plan designed to improve non-executive member engagement with Council decision making. Examples were given of some of recent developments such as the fact-finding budget scrutiny meetings and the regular meetings between the Cabinet member and Chair and Vice of the Children's Services Committee. The Chairman has offered to attend the Standards Committee in January when it reviews progress against the action plan to give an insight to "life" in scrutiny so there would be greater understanding of its powers and limitations.

(3) The Chairman reminded the Committee that the community meals service had been the subject of a call-in at a special meeting in April. Although the outcome was not to ask the Executive to review its action, the Committee did ask for a progress report to this meeting. On the basis that members had been kept informed through regular bulletins and that new arrangements are successfully in place, the Chairman did not see the need to have a separate item on today's agenda bearing in mind all the other business to be dealt with.

42. **Real Time Bus Information** The Committee had considered this topic over the last two meetings and asked for a clear indication from the Executive about the project's level of priority, resourcing, management and future delivery. A report by the Director of Environmental Services was circulated.

Members discussed the continuing problems with the customer-facing element of the system and the level of investment already made. Members acknowledged the significant benefit to the travelling public when the system was working reliably. Despite continuing reservations, members heard that the additional investment of 18.5 hours per week would bring about the necessary improvements to the data input/management, along with the establishment of a project team and action plan. It was anticipated that the additional hours would be in place in two months time and an action plan available in six months.

**Resolved:**

- (1) To welcome the priority and commitment given by the Cabinet Member to resourcing the additional 18.5 hours identified to make Real Time information more effective.**
- (2) To note that a business case for the proposed Traffic Control Centre was being developed as part of the Front Line Services work stream of the One Council for Wiltshire transition**
- (3) To receive a copy of the proposed new Project Team's Action Plan to address under performance in six months' time, including the comments of the Director of Resources on the management of the project**
- (4) To note that the bus operators support the actions proposed in the report**
- (5) To draw the attention of the Salisbury District Transportation Joint Committee to consideration of this matter.**

43. **Cycle Lanes Scrutiny Task Force** The Task Group reported its findings and recommendations last March and received a supportive response from the Cabinet Member. This was the 12 month review of implementation of those recommendations. The members who served on the Group at the time were John English (Chairman), Patrick Coleman, Ross Henning, Margaret Taylor and Charles Winchcombe.

A report by the Director of Environmental Services was circulated updating the members on progress. John English commented on the report and in his view the lack of meaningful progress particularly on the issues of shared use and contraflow schemes. Officers explained that the focus was on the urban network in the County Council's control and the difficulties some schemes presented where there were opposing local views. Members also commented on recent local experiences in Salisbury, Chippenham and Devizes.

**Resolved:**

- (1) To thank the Director of Environmental Services for the review update and for the commitment that officers will have regard to the recommendations of the Task Group and seek to implement options that align with them where possible.**
- (2) To remove the topic from the Committee's work programme subject to the provisions in (3) below.**
- (3) To ask that the Director keeps John English, as the Chairman of the previous Task Group, informed of:**
  - (i) the review of the cycling liaison panels (page 8 rec. 4 refers);**
  - (ii) the views of the consultant regarding opportunities for the Council to take wider advantages of planning gain in respect of any cycle lane provision (page 5 rec.9);**
  - (iii) the review of Council's Cycle Action Plan (page 5 rec.10), and;**
  - (iv) contentious local schemes in the County as they arise (page 6 rec.12).**
- (4) To emphasise the importance of early engagement with the local member on any proposed cycle lane scheme.**

44. **Street Management Task Group Final Report**      A copy of the Task Group's final report was circulated.

The task group was set up at the November meeting last year to review the street management element of the LSP's Streetscene objective. The members who served on the Task Group were Ian West (Chairman), Ross Henning, Pat Rugg, Tony Trotman and Charles Winchcombe.

Ian West introduced the report and highlighted the background to the review and main issues considered. He commented on the good work of the joint officers' technical group but questioned the overall management of the project at a strategic level. He remarked that the outcome, although important, took on a different perspective as a consequence of One Council.

**Resolved:**

- (1) To thank the members of the Task Group, with the support of the Assistant Director of Environmental Services and the scrutiny officer, for their efforts in reviewing this topic.**
- (2) To endorse the conclusions and recommendations in the final report for submission to the Street Scene Project Board, district councils, and the County Council's Cabinet Member, and to receive their comments to a future meeting.**
- (3) To appoint Ian West as the Committee's representative to undertake further scrutiny of the project (including the implications of the smoking ban) through periodic meetings with Tracy Carter, Assistant Director.**
- (4) To note that monitoring against LPSA targets was undertaken by the Committee's Performance Task Group, and that similar arrangements would be made in relation to the LAA. However to recognise the importance of the need to hold the LSP to wider public account for the delivery of strategic objectives and that this should feature as part of the enhanced overview and scrutiny arrangements envisaged by Government in its LG Bill.**

**45. Wiltshire Highways Consultancy and Works Contracts - Annual Review of Service 2006/07**

A joint report by the County Council, Ringway and Mouchel Parkman was circulated, along with a covering report by the Director of Environmental Services. This report covered the first year of the separated contract and representatives from the three organisations were present.

The Overview and Scrutiny Management Committee reviews annually the performance of the Council's major contracts in accordance with the Corporate Procurement Strategy. Last year in acknowledging the intention to produce a joint report, the Management Committee asked that more emphasis was given to making year on year comparisons where possible in order to assist in identifying trends.

Representatives from Mouchel Parkman and Ringway spoke about their respective services. They highlighted the positive aspects of the new contract arrangements and good performance during the review period, as well as a number of issues including the problems experienced by using remote design and management of schemes. Officers also explained the KPI scoring model and the monitoring systems.

Members asked questions and raised issues including the impact of improved surfacing on vehicle speed, the success of the parish stewards, the process for identifying priorities, monitoring of road noise, conditions for cyclists, impact of persistent wet weather and flooding, and member communication.

**Resolved:**

- (1) To thank Mouchel Parkman and Ringway for attending the meeting and for their continuing contribution to the County's highway service under the first year of the new contracts.**
  - (2) To note the provisional recommendation of a six month contract extension to Ringway and a three month extension to Mouchel Parkman as a result of their performance during 2006-2007.**
  - (3) To highlight the following areas identified for attention as a result of the review:**
    - (i) some delays in issuing briefs to consultants;**
    - (ii) concerns about delays in scheme delivery as a consequence of the need for third-party involvement;**
    - (iii) difficulties in recruitment and retention of specialist technical skills – and the lack of local knowledge if these are applied remotely; and,**
    - (iv) some concerns about the impact on the delivery and quality of schemes as a consequence of resource levels.**
  - (4) To support that a jointly prepared report from the County Council's officers, Mouchel Parkman and Ringway be submitted next year to review performance of the highway contracts in 2007-2008, and that this will additionally cover:**
    - (i) scoring and undertakings of the County Council as client; and,**
    - (ii) identification of potential sites for a highways material recycling centre.**
  - (5) To ask the Director to consider whether the weekly road works reports could be targeted more to members at a local level.**
  - (6) To advise the Cabinet Member of the Committee's consideration of the Annual Review when exercising her delegated authority to approve the review.**
- 46. Sodexho Support Services Contract - Annual Service Review 2006/07**  
The annual review of service report by Sodexho, along with a covering report by the Director of Environmental Services, was circulated.

The Overview and Scrutiny Management Committee reviews annually the performance of the Council's major contracts in accordance with the Corporate Procurement Strategy. The Committee were also reminded that in January this year, it received a report on the project for the replacement of the current contracts and appointed Ricky Rogers to serve on the project board.

The representatives from Sodexho introduced the report highlighting the improved performance in all areas and the value placed by clients on the service. Issues discussed by members included the actions being taken to encourage the take up of school meals, reduced contract monitoring, the withdrawal of community meals, and possible contract extension.

**Resolved:**

- (1) To note the contents of the Sodexho Annual Review report, and the inclusion of a second part 2 relating to possible contract extension.**
- (2) To acknowledge the continued levels of satisfactory performance by Sodexho under the contract.**
- (3) To note the previous decision to appoint Ricky Rogers to the project board and seek an update report when negotiations on possible contract extension were concluded.**
- (4) To note the Children Services Scrutiny Committee's ongoing interest in the schools meals service.**

47. **Social Care Scrutiny – Proposals for the Future** It was reported that John English, Chairman of the Social Care Task Group, with support from the Scrutiny Officer, had reviewed a briefing note summarising the current position against the recommendations in the Task Group's final report. This was intended to inform a view about whether the task group should continue with its work.

It was recognised that the social care modernisation project had not progressed as first planned following responses to consultation, particularly in respect of day care services. It was also reported that the Health Overview and Scrutiny Committee had recently appointed a task group to look at the whole system of care for older people and would play an increasing role in scrutinising adult social care services as the two services moved towards joint planning and delivery.

**Resolved: In light of the above, not to re-establish the Social Care Task Group.**

48. **Request for a Review of Waste Management Policy** Details of a member request submitted by Malcolm Hewson to review the Council's waste policies in the light of views expressed by Wiltshire Friends of the Earth was circulated. The request had received the support of Judy Rooke, Steve Oldrieve, Ross Henning and Patrick Coleman, and an initial response by the Director of Environmental Services was also circulated.

It was reported that the Management Committee had previously established a Task Group on Waste which reported back in April 2004. At that time Cabinet supported the findings and recommendations and a progress report on implementation was considered by the Committee in September 2005.

Malcolm Hewson attended the meeting and spoke to his request. He highlighted the need to consider the relative costs of disposal methods and the strategies necessary to minimise the carbon footprint of current policies. Tony Molland, who was the chairman of the previous task group, spoke against the need for a further review, on the basis that there was no new evidence to suggest that the current waste strategy was not effective in delivering efficient collection and disposal arrangements. He referred to the good performance being achieved against Government targets and maintained that waste to energy was the only viable alternative to landfill.

Tony Molland moved and Tony Trotman seconded a motion that the request to establish a new task group to review the Waste Strategy should not be supported at the current time. During debate members discussed the carbon footprint impact of the current policy and commented on the approach to handling plastics and card. John English also reminded the Committee of the review being undertaken on climate change by Salisbury DC and the potential benefit of linking these two reviews. Officers outlined current priorities and targets, and commented on the work being done in respect of greenhouse gases.

The Chairman proposed an amendment to the motion that, in the first instance, a report on this work by the Waste Partnership be brought to the next meeting. This was accepted by Tony Molland and Tony Trotman as mover and seconded of the original motion.

A further amendment was moved by Tony Deane, seconded by Ian West that a task group be established to look specifically at the current approach to greenhouse gases including carbon emissions of the waste collection and disposals policies. On being put to the vote the amendment was carried. This then became the substantive motion which was also put to the vote and was carried.

**Resolved:**

- (1) To thank Malcolm Hewson for his request and for attending the meeting.**
- (2) To establish a task group with the following terms of reference:**
  - (i) to consider the carbon footprint of waste collection and disposal services in the context of their overall environmental impact;**
  - (ii) to consider ways in which the overall environmental impact, including the carbon footprint, of waste collection and disposal services might be reduced (a) by adjusting the contribution of different methods of collection and treatment and (b) by introducing specific new services such as kerbside collection of food waste, plastics and cardboard**
  - (iii) to consider the cost of, and availability of resources for such improvements.**

**(3) To appoint Malcolm Hewson, Judy Rooke, Ian West, Tony Deane and Mollie Groom as members of the task group and that a chairman be elected at its first meeting.**

**(4) To ask that the task group report back within 3 months of its first meeting and that a representative from the Department of Environmental Services be invited to the first meeting to advise in scoping the review**

49. **Summary Statement – Wiltshire Flooding Procedures** The Chairman reported that in the light of recent national events, including some affecting our neighbouring counties, he had sought reassurances from Emergency Planning about the County's preparedness in the event of major flooding. As a consequence, a summary statement was circulated for this meeting.

The Chairman was of the opinion that a members' seminar should be arranged so that all members, in their community leadership roles, were aware of the position.

**Resolved: To support the Chairmen's suggestion for a members' seminar on this topic, and that an invitation be extended to district members.**

50. **Scrutiny of One Council for Wiltshire** It was reported that now an announcement on the bid had been made, work was beginning on transition to the new authority. A significant number of activities were planned under four main work streams reporting to a Joint Implementation Board and Transition Cabinet. An early view had been sought about suitable overview and scrutiny arrangements for the transition.

The Chairman and Vice-Chairman had given an initial view that, with the fixed resources available to Scrutiny, it was likely that these would be best utilised by tapping into the reports to the main executive bodies perhaps via a single high-profile task group. From these reports any task group could then focus on specific areas of interest or risk arising from the work streams ie. planning, community area boards etc. for further review including the ability to appoint a "lead" scrutiny member. The whole of the non-executive membership would be at the task group's disposal for this type of role – reporting back to the task group as appropriate.

It was felt that the terms of reference, capacity/resources and membership of any task group would need careful planning and would include an invitation to district council members. Further information is expected from Central Government about the transitional governance arrangements and therefore the views of full Council on 21 September will be important in many regards, including on the issue of the role of members.

**Resolved: To note the early views expressed by the Chairman and Vice-Chairman and be aware of the need to consider how the Committee might wish to engage in the scrutiny of One Council, particularly in the light of any resolution of full Council.**



51. **Work Programme** A copy of the latest version of the Management Committee's work programme was circulated which would be amended to reflect the decisions taken at this meeting. A report by Tony Deane, Chairman of the Customer First (and Change Management) Task Group advocating the need to hold a seminar on "Lean Principles" was also circulated.

**Resolved:** To note the following scrutiny activities taking place under the direction of the Management Committee and support the proposal to hold a members' seminar on lean principles:

<u>Activity</u>	<u>Topic</u>	<u>Members</u>	<u>Start Date</u>	<u>Next Meeting</u>	<u>End Date</u>
Task Groups	Performance	Mr Newbury (Ch) Mr Osborn Mrs Soden Mrs Taylor Mr While	Nov 02	TBC	Standing
	Budget	Mr Molland (Ch) Brig Hall Mr Coleman Mr Rogers Mr Moss Mr Osborn	Sept 01	12 Sept	Standing
	Customer First	Mr Deane (Ch) Ms Content Mr Dalton Mr A Davis Mr Newbury Mrs Rugg	June 05	26 Sept	Standing
	Street Management	Mr Trotman Mrs Rugg Mr Winchcombe Mr West (Ch) Mr Henning	Jan 07	-	Sept 07
	Museums	Brig Hall (Ch) Mrs Groom Mr Trotman Mr Henning Mr Newbury	June 07	18 Sept	Nov 07
Procurement Project Boards	Property Services	Mr Henning	Sept 05	-	Ongoing
	Adult Care (including OSJ Care Services)	Dr English	Jan 06	-	Ongoing
	Business Management Programme	Mr Deane	Feb 06	-	Dec 07
	Sodexo Replacement	Mr Rogers	March 07	-	Nov 07

(Duration of Meeting: 10.30am – 1.25pm)

The Officer who has produced these minutes is Paul Kelly, Democratic & Members' Services, direct line: (01225) 713049.